

# Religious Freedom, LGBT Rights, and the Prospects for Common Ground

Edited by

**WILLIAM N. ESKRIDGE, JR.**

Yale University

**ROBIN FRETWELL WILSON**

University of Illinois Urbana-Champaign



**CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

# CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)

Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9781108470155](http://www.cambridge.org/9781108470155)

DOI: 10.1017/9781316999752

© William N. Eskridge, Jr. and Robin Fretwell Wilson 2019

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2019

Printed and bound in Great Britain by Clays Ltd, Elcograph S.p.A.

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.*

### *Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data*

NAMES: Eskridge, William N., Jr., 1951-, editor. | Wilson, Robin Fretwell, editor.

TITLE: Religious freedom, LGBT rights, and the prospects for common ground /

Edited by William N. Eskridge Jr., Yale University, Connecticut, Robin Fretwell Wilson, University of Illinois Urbana-Champaign.

DESCRIPTION: New York : Cambridge University Press, 2018. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2018024259 | ISBN 9781108470155 (hardback : alk. paper) |

ISBN 9781108454582 (pbk. : alk. paper)

SUBJECTS: LCSH: Freedom of religion—United States. | Sexual minorities—Civil rights—United States. | Discrimination—Religious aspects. | Civil rights—Religious aspects.

CLASSIFICATION: LCC KF4783 .R429 2018 | DDC 342.7308/52—dc23

LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2018024259>

ISBN 978-1-108-47015-5 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

# Contents

<i>List of Contributors</i>	<i>page xi</i>
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	<i>xxiii</i>
<b>1</b> <b>Prospects for Common Ground: Introduction</b> <i>William N. Eskridge, Jr. and Robin Fretwell Wilson</i>	<b>1</b>
<b>PART I THE SEARCH FOR COMMON GROUND: FRAMING THE DIALOGUE</b>	
<b>2</b> <b>Choosing among Non-Negotiated Surrender, Negotiated Protection of Liberty and Equality, or Learning and Earning Empathy</b> <i>Alan Brownstein</i>	<b>11</b>
<b>3</b> <b>Liberty and Justice for All</b> <i>Douglas Laycock</i>	<b>24</b>
<b>4</b> <b>Belief and Belonging: Reconciling Legal Protections for Religious Liberty and LGBT Youth</b> <i>Shannon Price Minter</i>	<b>38</b>
<b>5</b> <b>Religious Freedom, Civil Rights, and Sexuality: A Christian Ethics Perspective</b> <i>Dennis P. Hollinger</i>	<b>56</b>
<b>PART II GUIDING PRINCIPLES FOR MEDIATING CONFLICTS</b>	
<b>6</b> <b>Religious Accommodation, and Its Limits, in a Pluralist Society</b> <i>Douglas NeJaime and Reva B. Siegel</i>	<b>69</b>

7	“The Devil Is in the Details”: On the Central Importance of Distinguishing the Truly Public from the Truly Private in Reconciling Equality and Religious Liberty <i>Ronald J. Krotoszynski, Jr.</i>	82
8	Mutual Tolerance and Sensible Exemptions <i>Kent Greenawalt</i>	102
9	The Joys of Mutual Contempt <i>Andrew Koppelman</i>	111
10	From Conflict to Coexistence: The Catholic Response to the LGBT Community <i>Sister Jeannine Gramick</i>	119
11	Implied-Consent Religious Institutionalism: Applications and Limits <i>Michael A. Helfand</i>	135
PART III THE DEMANDS OF FAITH: PERSPECTIVES FROM SELECT FAITH TRADITIONS		
12	Christian Identity and Religious Liberty <i>Leith Anderson</i>	153
13	The “Demands” of Faith <i>Archbishop William E. Lori</i>	163
14	Toward Collaboration: A Perspective from The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints <i>Elder Von G. Keetch</i>	179
15	Conscience Claims in Islamic Law: A Case Study <i>Intisar A. Rabb</i>	183
16	Should an Amish Baker Sell a Cake for a Same-Sex Wedding? A Letter on Toleration of LGBT Rights from Anabaptists to Evangelicals <i>Jason R. Moyer</i>	200
PART IV TESTING THE CIVIL RIGHTS ANALOGY		
17	The Rhetoric of Bigotry and Conscience in Battles over “Religious Liberty v. LGBT Rights” <i>Linda C. McClain</i>	213

18	Against “Civil Rights” Simplism: How Not to Accommodate Competing Legal Commitments <i>Steven D. Smith</i>	233
19	Heterosexuals Only: Signs of the Times? <i>Louise Melling</i>	245
20	Conscience v. Access and the Morality of Human Rights, with Particular Reference to Same-Sex Marriage <i>Michael J. Perry</i>	256
21	On the Uses of Anti-Christian Identity Politics <i>Marc O. DeGirolami</i>	267
PART V STRINGS ATTACHED? GOVERNMENT SUPPORT OF RELIGION AND RELIGIOUS INSTITUTIONS		
22	Marriage Equality, Traditionalist Churches, and Tax Exemptions <i>William N. Eskridge, Jr.</i>	281
23	Why Money Matters: LGBT Rights and Religious Freedom <i>Holly Hollman</i>	295
24	Freedom to Serve: Religious Organizational Freedom, LGBT Rights, and the Common Good <i>Thomas C. Berg</i>	307
PART VI EDUCATIONAL INSTITUTIONS IN THE AGE OF SAME-SEX MARRIAGE		
25	Two Paths: Finding a Way Forward at Covenantal Universities <i>Shirley V. Hoogstra, Shapri D. LoMaglio, and Brad Crofford</i>	329
26	God and Man and Religious Exemptions in the Modern University <i>B. Jessie Hill</i>	344
PART VII THE CHALLENGES OF PUBLIC ACCOMMODATIONS		
27	Challenges to True Fairness for All: How SOGI Laws Are Unlike Civil Liberties and Other Nondiscrimination Laws and How to Craft Better Policy and Get Nondiscrimination Laws Right <i>Ryan T. Anderson</i>	361
28	Dressmakers, Bakers, and the Equality of Rights <i>Michael W. McConnell</i>	378

29	It's Not About the Cake: Against "Altering" the Public Marketplace <i>Jennifer C. Pizer</i>	385
30	Bathrooms and Bakers: How Sharing the Public Square Is the Key to a Truce in the Culture Wars <i>Robin Fretwell Wilson</i>	402
PART VIII REFLECTIONS FROM ADVOCATES, LEGISLATORS, AND POLICYMAKERS		
31	Sound Nondiscrimination Models and the Need to Protect LGBTQ People in Federal Law <i>Sarah Warbelow</i>	423
32	Cultivating Common Ground: Lessons from Utah for Living with Our Differences <i>Senator J. Stuart Adams</i>	441
33	Shared Spaces and Brave Gambles <i>Governor Michael O. Leavitt</i>	460
PART IX AFTERWORD		
34	<i>Masterpiece Cakeshop</i> : Impact on the Search for Common Ground <i>Rabbi David N. Saperstein</i>	479
	<i>Appendix of Laws</i> <i>Robin Fretwell Wilson</i>	499
	<i>Subject Index</i>	525
	<i>Laws Index</i>	539
	<i>Cases Index</i>	541