



We help researchers succeed

## Developmental Editing Report Template

### **Congratulations on taking this step toward your publication goals!**

This report template will help you and your colleagues provide feedback on revising manuscripts to improve its organization and to clarify your argument. This report will guide you through the major sections of an Original Research Report, with detailed checklists that itemize the important features of that section.

We hope that you find this document to be useful in preparing manuscripts for publication.

### **Author Instructions:**

1. Please read the draft of the article fully from abstract to conclusions. This will give you an idea of how well the entire paper is structured and whether the sections are consistent with each other.
2. Fill out the checklist for each of the individual sections of the paper.
  - a. If this aspect of the paper is strong and requires little, if any, revision, add a ✓ under Yes.
  - b. If this aspect of the paper needs improvement and will require some revision, add an X under No.
  - c. If the item does not apply to this manuscript, then do not add a ✓ or an X.
3. For any aspect of the paper that you give an X, you can include further explanation and suggested revisions in the comments for that section.
4. After completing the checklist sections, write a short summary of the paper for the Manuscript Summary section. This section should show whether the content of the paper was clearly understood or more work needs to be done so that a reader gets the intended message.
5. Complete the Top 3 Recommendations section describing the three major weaknesses that are most essential for the authors to address.



We help researchers succeed

## Manuscript Summary:

## Top 3 Recommendations:

- 1.
- 2.
- 3.



We help researchers succeed

## Checklist and Comments by Section:

### 1. Title and Abstract

Yes	No	
		1. The title accurately and succinctly describes the main topic of the manuscript.
		2. The title includes all appropriate key terms to alert readers to the content.
		3. The abstract includes a clearly stated objective and sufficient background information to support the study's rationale.
		4. The abstract contains sufficient description of key methods.
		5. The abstract contains sufficient description of key results.
		6. The abstract clearly states the conclusions of the study.
		7. The abstract is consistent with the rest of the manuscript.
		8. The abstract is well organized and concise.

### Comments:

- 1.1)
- 1.2)
- 1.3)
- 1.4)
- 1.5)
- 1.6)
- 1.7)
- 1.8)



We help researchers succeed

## 2. Introduction

Yes	No	
		1. The Introduction provides sufficient background and context for the study, with citations.
		2. The gap in the literature or unanswered question that motivated the current study is clearly defined and provides the rationale for the study.
		3. The objective/hypothesis flows logically from the background information.
		4. The objective/hypothesis is clearly stated and consistent with the research performed.
		5. The last paragraph summarizes the study's objective and approach.
		6. The Introduction is organized effectively.

### Comments:

- 2.1)
- 2.2)
- 2.3)
- 2.4)
- 2.5)
- 2.6)



We help researchers succeed

### 3. Materials and Methods

Yes	No
	1. Relevant materials (e.g., reagents, strains) and their sources are clearly identified.
	2. Experimental methods are described concisely.
	3. Experimental methods are described with enough detail for reproducibility.
	4. Experimental and control groups, including inclusion and exclusion criteria when appropriate, are clearly identified and described.
	5. Methods from past studies are cited, as appropriate.
	6. Ethics statements for human and animal studies are present, as appropriate.
	7. Statistical methods are described clearly.
	8. The Methods and Materials section is organized effectively.

#### Comments:

- 3.1)
- 3.2)
- 3.3)
- 3.4)
- 3.5)
- 3.6)
- 3.7)
- 3.8)



We help researchers succeed

#### 4. Results

Yes	No
	1. Findings are presented clearly and succinctly and are supported by data.
	2. Data in tables and figures are NOT repeated verbatim in the text.
	3. Data in tables and figures are appropriately cited when mentioned in the Results.
	4. All results directly relate to the study objective.
	5. Data for all experiments described in the Materials and Methods are thoroughly presented in the Results.
	6. Data presented in the Results have corresponding experiments described in the Methods and Materials.
	7. Statistical analyses and comparisons are reported where appropriate.
	8. If appropriate, complete clinical and demographic descriptions of subjects are provided.
	9. Information presented in the Results belongs in this section and not the Introduction, Materials and Methods, or Discussion.
	10. The Results section is organized effectively.

#### Comments:

- 4.1)
- 4.2)
- 4.3)
- 4.4)
- 4.5)
- 4.6)
- 4.7)
- 4.8)
- 4.9)
- 4.10)



We help researchers succeed

### 5. Figures, Tables, and Illustrations:

Yes	No	
		1. Data presented in figures and tables relate to the study objective.
		2. Data presented in figures and tables are consistent with the description of results in the text.
		3. Figures and tables are ordered logically and numbered sequentially.
		4. Figures are clearly labeled (with units, panel labels, etc. where necessary).
		5. Each figure or table legend explains all major features.
		6. Figure and table titles are succinct yet informative.

#### Comments:

- 5.1)
- 5.2)
- 5.3)
- 5.4)
- 5.5)
- 5.6)



We help researchers succeed

## 6. Discussion and Conclusions:

Yes	No	
		1. The Discussion is clearly focused on the objectives of the study.
		2. All major results are addressed.
		3. The results that are addressed in the Discussion are presented in the Results.
		4. Comparisons with other studies are relevant and informative.
		5. All speculative statements are properly identified as such.
		6. The implications of the current study are presented persuasively.
		7. The novel contributions of the study are appropriately highlighted.
		8. Limitations of the study are addressed, as appropriate.
		9. Future directions for additional research are identified.
		10. Conclusions are consistent with the rest of the manuscript, including the abstract.
		11. Conclusions are clearly articulated, follow logically from the rest of the Discussion, and are supported by the data presented in the Results.
		12. The Discussion section is organized effectively.

### Comments:

- 6.1)
- 6.2)
- 6.3)
- 6.4)
- 6.5)
- 6.6)
- 6.7)
- 6.8)
- 6.9)
- 6.10)
- 6.11)
- 6.12)





We help researchers succeed

**Other Comments:**